

APPENDIX A – PRIMARY OPTIONS

Option No.1 Do Nothing

Overview

Community groups would continue to run as currently established with no strategic investment or development vision. Small projects would continue to be progressed with varying degrees of success due to the continued un-co-ordinated approach and need for improved clarity of roles and communications. Whilst the peace and tranquillity of Barr would not be adversely impacted by an influx of visitors and tourists, the continued decrease in footfall would adversely impact existing accommodation and service providers including the shop. The shop is currently at risk as cannot be sustained by the community alone (operating at a loss of £15-20K annually) and grant funding cannot be relied upon as an ongoing revenue stream. In the absence of a robust business case and development plan, the shop is unlikely to secure additional funds to bridge the gap and therefore may close.

Both the pub and Dinmurchie remain on public sale, the future of each entirely dependent upon a third party buyer. Buyers may be deterred by the lack of development and investment within the village. If the future of the pub and shop cannot be secured, community spirit will diminish and the condition of the buildings could deteriorate, adversely affecting the landscape and environment. Community groups would remain as they are. Small, individual projects (such as cosmetic enhancements, youth clubs, mobile/wifi etc would continue to be progressed with varying degrees of success due to unco-ordinated approach).

The community would continue to lobby for improved public transport which is unlikely to be more than the 3 x per day 3 day a week service provision currently being proposed.

Strategic Outcomes Assessment

Strategic Outcome	Significant Negative	Moderate Negative	Minor Negative	Neutral	Minor Benefit	Moderate Benefit	Significant Benefit	Consultant Assessment/Recommendation
Improve accessibility to / from Barr				0				Rural villages must have a strategic approach to planning, investment and development in order to maintain what they have now, and survive if not thrive. This is particularly relevant to Barr which is not a passing through place. Without visitors, and spend, the community could diminish over the coming years with empty houses and buildings failing to sell. The quality of life for residents will reduce resulting in declining population. This option does not address the transportation issue. There is an ongoing proposal for improved services via South Ayrshire Community Transport Network, but this is subject to funding and so not yet guaranteed. Communications may improve within Barr if driven by individuals or groups, however as this is an unknown, we have scored neutral. This option is not recommended. Score -15 (of possible 24)
Improve communications within Barr				0				
Improve communications externally				0				
Improve quality of life of residents	-3							
Improve quality of visitor experience	-3							
Increase visitor and tourism numbers	-3							
Engage the youth voice	-3							
Maintain or enhance the landscape and environment	-3							

Option No.2 Do Minimum

Overview

BPDC would seek to purchase the village shop and pub (if both buildings are available for sale and funding can be secured). The assets would be developed to a suitable standard by BPDC and leased to commercial or social enterprises to run for the benefit of the local community and visitors. Any income gained by BPDC would be used to maintain the assets. It is unlikely that a profit will be achievable, therefore no surplus funds for community projects. Any individual or group may apply to lease/operate the assets separately or jointly from BPDC i.e. the previous pub owners/the existing BSSG or a newly formed enterprise or third party. In an effort to support the ongoing sustainability of both enterprises, BPDC will seek funding to provide branding and marketing support as follows:

Brand Barr - Define what it is that differentiates Barr from other local towns and villages, define the features and benefits of the existing offering (and on an ongoing basis any additional offerings), identify the target audience(s), consider competitors and establish a brand image.

Develop and implement marketing strategy - liaise with accommodation and service providers in Barr to establish the baseline i.e. current visitor and tourist numbers, conduct additional public perception surveys (in Maidens/Turnberry and return to Kirkoswald during peak visitor times), ascertain the volume and origins of visitors and tourists in those neighbouring towns and villages, assess Barr's current approach to marketing including constraints, risks and opportunities i.e. channels, media/web presence etc, consider audiences and anticipate visiting patterns, define target markets, develop a marketing strategy including development of guidelines, process and tools including website/social media, promotion materials etc

Historically, the village hasn't been able to sustain a pub and shop without the support of grant funding. Funding must not be viewed as an ongoing revenue stream and so it is imperative that a detailed business case for the development and growth of each enterprise is prepared and submitted to BPDC before any lease agreement can be signed.

Community groups would operate as they currently do with no change to structure. Communications between groups and with wider community would be improved as part of overall communications strategy as developed by the Marketing Consultant.

This option would not justify the cost of a full time development officer and so will be heavily reliant on volunteers continue to support.

Small, individual projects (such as cosmetic enhancements, youth clubs, mobile/wifi etc would continue to be progressed with varying degrees of success due to unco-ordinated approach).

This option would not be able to sustain a community bus service. The community would continue to lobby for improved public transport which may provide 3 x per day 3 day a week service provision (if funding is approved).

Strategic Outcomes Assessment

Strategic Outcome	Significant Negative	Moderate Negative	Minor Negative	Neutral	Minor Benefit	Moderate Benefit	Significant Benefit	Consultant Recommendation
Improve accessibility to / from Barr				0				This option will not directly improve accessibility to and from Barr nor does it facilitate the engagement of the youth voice. There is a moderate benefit to the quality of life of residents and the visitor experience as the pub would be reinstated and the shop would be protected. However, this may only be a short term fix. The community alone cannot sustain the shop and the pub (as history shows). Whilst the introduction of a marketing consultant will help improve communications both internally and externally, initially, and there is likely to be an increase in visitors due to greater awareness and promotion of Barr, there is no proposed development officer to continue that marketing (beyond the consultant's involvement) and it is therefore entirely reliant on volunteers. Survey data suggests that whilst a pub and shop are fundamental to service the visitor and tourist community – these are viewed as basic requirements. To attract return visitors and those that stay and spend, an attraction of sorts or a wider choice of family activities / pursuits would be required. For the above reasons, this option is not considered to be an effective long term/sustainable solution. Score +12 (of possible 24)
Improve communications within Barr						+2		
Improve communications externally						+2		
Improve quality of life of residents						+2		
Improve quality of visitor experience						+2		
Increase visitor and tourism numbers						+2		
Engage the youth voice				0				
Maintain or enhance the landscape and environment						+2		

Option No.3 Moderate Infrastructure

Overview

This option is entirely community led, in that it has been developed following consultation with the community on a 'needs' basis. All available assets within the village (those commercial and domestic buildings currently up for sale + prospective properties) will be assessed to determine their suitability for use. To determine the costs, the purpose for which the buildings will be utilised, must first be determined. Only once the use has been determined, can the design and development costs + purchase costs be confirmed, allowing an effective comparison. Following consultation, we have identified the following needs / solutions:

Community Hub – a mixed use facility, centrally located within the village. We propose that this would combine a high quality food, drink, entertainment and retail offering. Gifts as well as convenience goods could be sold here. The village hall has good space but is a local authority building which can be difficult to secure funding for. The pub offers accommodation as an additional offering but the structure of the building may cause restrictions in design and increase development costs. Nearby domestic properties of suitable size should be identified and potentially costed for comparison.

Business And Recreation Room – a mixed use facility providing IT/hot desk/office facilities for residents and particularly youths/students. A bright and airy environment is required. A broad range of training courses would be provided by volunteers and experts from this location including business planning support, computer training etc. Meeting rooms and conference facilities can be used by local community groups. Both meeting rooms and hot desks can be hired by business / enterprise owners for a small fee. Mobile and wifi will be required. Local groups and businesses can access printing / business services from this location including printing, laminating, binding, franking machine services for a small fee.

Meeting rooms can be hired by sole trade business owners such as Chiropractors/Beauticians/Hair Stylists. A crèche type facility will also be located within this centre – for hire by any interested individual / enterprise owner/ who may wish to provide before and after school care, holiday clubs etc. In addition to the above, there is a need for a visitor information area, including what's on guides and special booking offers. It is recommended that the Visitor and Business Centres are managed by a full time development officer (or 2 part time officers) with support from seasonal staff and volunteers.

The village hall, existing shop building and domestic properties could be potential venues for the BARR. The village hall should be explored having the potential to house all of the above, whilst providing additional facilities such as a small soft play facility, larger conference rooms, and café facilities – however we may struggle to obtain funding due to the similarities with and proximity of the Carrick Centre in Maybole, together with the fact that the hall is a local authority asset. The benefits and costs of the village hall should be compared with the purchase and development costs of the shop which would provide a smaller and possibly more affordable and manageable centre. HUB/BARR – The potential of basing both the hub and BARR in the same building or joining/extending buildings should also be considered for comparison purposes.

Barr Bus – it is proposed that the community purchase a small mini-bus with a commercial focus that provides a community benefit. There is currently no guided tour bus in the area. A small tour bus could cover the area of Barr, Girvan, Turnberry, Maidens, Kirkoswald and Maybole on a continuous loop at set times of the day. This means all of those untapped visitors in the surrounding areas, can be targeted and brought directly to Barr, and those tourists staying in Barr could benefit from the tour service. At other times of the day, the bus would provide direct services from Barr to Girvan. The bus would be available for hire by community groups and businesses.

Camp Site – increases the choice of accommodation on offer, attracts wider range of tourists and will ultimately increase footfall and spend within the village. Explore options for the provision of a low risk, suitably located camp site to appeal to wider tourist market. The camp site would capitalise on USPs such as dark skies, wildlife, outdoor pursuits, food/drink offering etc. The site could be a basic wild camping site (for which there is a high demand), or pitches with basic toilet/shower facilities, or a multi-accommodation offering including pitches, touring caravans and glamping pods. It is important to assess each of the above, the costs, benefits and risks associated with same including the impact on the village i.e. a glamping pod site will noticeably change the landscape of the village and may look too touristy for residents, the location of the site may be too close to domestic properties raising concerns about security, noise etc, conversely, a partnership agreement may be entered into with FCS to use woodland areas. The scale of the camp site must also be considered to ensure visitor numbers do not become excessive.

Proposed Management Structure – to support the planning, development and implementation of this option, we would propose two of the current community groups be disbanded i.e. Barr Parish Development Company and Barr Stores Steering Group. We would recommend that a new social enterprise is established which for the purpose of this study will be called the 'New Community Group'. The New Community Group would be an economic development group, focused on creating jobs, training and development opportunities through the development of land/assets whilst providing support and enabling prospective entrepreneurs. Because it would be a social enterprise, individuals can be paid a salary, seasonal jobs can be offered and profits would go straight back into community projects such as subsidising the community bus and the youth club.

The New Community Group would seek funding to engage an architect and quantity surveyor to lead the design and costing of the various buildings for comparison purposes. The Architects will support planning application and funding applications for capital and development costs. Once the preferred buildings have been identified and uses agreed, the community will be consulted to support funding and planning applications. The New Community Group would own the hub, the business and recreation room, the community bus and the camp site land. It would not be feasible for the community group to secure the assets on a lease agreement as the group would be responsible for development and maintenance of the asset. The community group would therefore require to own, develop and maintain the assets. The New Community Group would seek funding to engage an architect and quantity surveyor to lead the design and costing of the various buildings for comparison purposes. The Architects will support planning application and funding applications for capital and development costs. Once the preferred buildings have been identified and uses agreed, the community will be consulted to support funding and planning applications. Third party Individuals or groups will be eligible to apply to lease the hub and the camp site to operate as per stated purpose. Individuals and groups will be supported with business plans and funding applications by the New Community Group and the development officer(s).

The community bus and business and recreation room will be owned and operated by the New Community Group. Revenue streams will be achieved via bus ticket sales and bookings, room and desk hire as well as business centre facilities. In addition to the above, the New Community Group will fund a communication brand and marketing strategy as follows:

- **Communication strategy** – work with existing community groups including Barr Community Association, Barr Community Council to and the New Community Group to clarify purpose, clear lines of communication, reporting and governance with a view to achieving a shared vision and co-ordinated funding applications. Communication from groups to residents will be centrally managed and improved. It is recommended that one group takes ownership of governance ensuring decisions made re investment and development are for the benefit of all and not the few.
- **Brand Barr** - Define what it is that differentiates Barr from other local towns and villages, define the features and benefits of the existing offering (and on an ongoing basis any additional offerings), identify the target audience(s), consider competitors and establish a brand image.
- **Develop and implement marketing strategy** - liaise with accommodation and service providers in Barr to establish the baseline i.e. current visitor and tourist numbers, conduct additional public perception surveys (in Maidens/Turnberry and return to Kirkoswald during peak visitor times), ascertain the volume and origins of visitors and tourists in those neighbouring towns and villages, assess Barr's current approach to marketing including constraints, risks and opportunities i.e. channels, media/web presence etc, consider audiences and anticipate visiting patterns, define target markets, develop a marketing strategy including development of guidelines, process and tools including website/social media, promotion materials etc

Youth Voice – as well as supporting business and enterprise owners, the community group would seek to establish/part fund a Youth Council or Group based out of the Business and Recreation facility. The youth group would have responsibilities and purpose including the design and publication of monthly community newsletters as well as supporting the New Community Group activities.

Option 3 Strategic Outcomes Assessment

Strategic Outcome	Significant Negative	Moderate Negative	Minor Negative	Neutral	Minor Benefit	Moderate Benefit	Significant Benefit	Consultant Recommendation
Improve accessibility to / from Barr							+3	This option would immediately improve the accessibility of Barr for residents and tourists through a community run and subsidised bus.
Improve communications within Barr							+3	
Improve communications externally							+3	
Improve quality of life of residents						+2		Disbanding the existing BPDC and BSSG will go some way to improving collaborative efforts and ensure the community is working towards a shared goal. The skills and availability of the directors and members will be streamlined and more focused as a result. The marketing consultant will help establish a communications strategy for internal and external communications, and the new governance structure will ensure fairness and transparency for all. It is hoped that the new facilities and the new approach will improve the quality of life for residents with immediate effect (improved community spirit coming together to share a common goal) and as time goes on, use of new facilities and the development of new community projects, self funded for the benefit of existing and future generations. In comparison to option 4, the amenities will be retained within the village which will suit elderly and less mobile specifically. The only reason we have not allocated significant benefit scoring here, is because some people have no desire to see an increase in footfall or developments and so one point has been deducted for the effect on those residents. The visitor experience will greatly improve, from accessibility, guided tours, good quality food, drink, entertainment, accommodation and recreation facilities. Youths will be proactively engaged, supported, funded and encouraged to participate and support succession. The branding and marketing strategy will go some way towards raising the profile and Barr and attracting more visitors and tourists which will in turn, help sustain the facilities. The highest possible scoring has been allocated for increased visitor numbers and tourists due to the ability to manage the flow and control of visitors at this scale of development versus option 4. With regards to improving the landscape, there will be a number of positive improvements and enhancements with the future of buildings protected and maintained by the community, however interim construction impacts and an increase in footfall has resulted in a point deduction. Score +22 (of possible 24)
Improve quality of visitor experience							+3	
Increase visitor and tourism numbers							+3	
Engage the youth voice							+3	
Maintain or enhance the landscape and environment						+2		

Option No.4 Major Infrastructure

Overview

The development of the farm would complement the enterprising approach of individuals, groups and businesses already working hard in the area. Multi-use of the facility could include outdoor education, wildlife, environment tourism, energy, the arts, cycling, camping and heritage.

Acquisition of the land would offer employment to local builders & trades including the establishment of apprenticeships during the renovation and building works, and in the long term, rural skills courses could be run in conjunction with the Forestry Commission as well as utilizing the older generation and invited specialist tutors/mentors with skills pertinent to Barr's situation and heritage. Once the building was complete, the centre itself would provide a range of job and enterprise opportunities.

As a tourist destination, the project could generate much needed income for the hotel/pub, community run shop/café, B& B's and self-catering facilities. A higher profile venue could boost visitor numbers and attract business, benefiting entities such as the volunteer run Tearoom, the Barr 'Wee gallery' and other local small businesses in the planning phase. The hope was that ultimately, new, improved or expanded local services and facilities would encourage repeat visits, longer stays and stimulate new markets.

Even in the short term, prior to major development, the site could offer a potential source of revenue, once cleared, for a small market garden area that residents are enthusiastic to take on. Meanwhile, the 'bunkhouse' requires some basic maintenance and tidy-up to be serviceable for outward bound groups to hire.

In the longer term, a proposed Hydro project could generate income and interest, and other renewable energy options such as Bio-mass and solar energy would be explored with FCS & CARES, and implemented to reduce running costs wherever appropriate.

As a minimum, the cost of Lot 1 House, Steadings and in bye land is £115,000. To support the purchase, BPDC would be required to seek funding from the Scottish Land Fund and the Big Lottery (Growing Community Assets Fund).

To develop the land (costs unknown), BPDC would require seek funding from the Big Lottery Growing Community Assets Fund, the Princes Rural Fund, the Heritage Lottery and LEADER.

Strategic Outcomes Assessment

Strategic Outcome	Significant Negative	Moderate Negative	Minor Negative	Neutral	Minor Benefit	Moderate Benefit	Significant Benefit	Consultant Recommendation
Improve accessibility to / from Barr				0				<p>Given the current economic conditions and the scale and complexity of this project, together with the fact that it takes activity away from the centre of the village, it is recommended that the community considers how best to make use of what exists within the village, and attempts to operate sustainably, prior to considering new build or major project development.</p> <p>It is proposed that the community works closely with the forestry commission to ascertain what can be achieved through partnership working without the costs, risks and liabilities associated with purchase and development of Dinmurchie as is.</p> <p>14/24</p>
Improve communications within Barr							+3	
Improve communications externally							+3	
Improve quality of life of residents				0	+1			
Improve quality of visitor experience							+3	
Increase visitor and tourism numbers							+3	
Engage the youth voice				0		+3		
Maintain or enhance the landscape and environment		-2						